Black Holes as Lumps of Fluid

Óscar Dias

DAMTP



University of Cambridge

Based on:

Marco Caldarelli, OD, Roberto Emparan, Dietmar Klemm, 0811.2381 Marco Caldarelli, OD, Dietmar Klemm, 0812.0801 Vitor Cardoso, OD, 0902.3560

Workshop on the Fluid-Gravity Correspondence

Arnold Sommerfeld Center, September 2009



- I. Motivation:
- Gravity / Gauge theory duality
- For high energy density, QFT has a hydrodynamic description



Gravity / Hydrodynamics duality

II. Gravity / Hydrodynamics duality ...







Fluid dynamics from gravity

(Battacharrya, Hubeny, Minwalla, Rangamani, 0712.2456) ("previous", Mandal, Morita, Reall, 0803.2526)

Start with (planar, k=0) black brane solution of Einstein-AdS (EF coord.):

$$ds^2=-2dv\,dr-r^2f({br})dv^2+r^2dx^idx^i$$
 $f(r)=1-rac{1}{r^4}$ Boost the black brane : eta^i

$$u^{arphi}=rac{1}{\sqrt{1-eta_i^2}}$$
 $u^{m i}=rac{eta^{m i}}{\sqrt{1-eta_i^2}}$ $P_{\mu
u}=u_\mu u_
u+\eta_{\mu
u}$ $ot u^\mu$

$$ds^{2} = -2u_{\mu}dx^{\mu}dr - r^{2}f(br)u_{\mu}u_{\nu}dx^{\mu}dx^{\nu} + r^{2}P_{\mu\nu}dx^{\mu}dx^{\nu}$$

$$\uparrow \qquad \uparrow$$

Allow boost and temperature to vary slowly with x^{μ} (bdry coords):

$$b = b(x^{\mu})$$
 $\beta^i = \beta^i(x^{\mu})$

Question:

Can we have BHs that tubewise approximate black branes in AdS?

Patches
AdS boundary

$$ds^2 = -2u_{\mu}dx^{\mu}dr - r^2f(br)u_{\mu}u_{\nu}dx^{\mu}dx^{\nu} + r^2P_{\mu\nu}dx^{\mu}dx^{\nu}$$

 $b = b(x^{\mu})$
 $\beta^i = \beta^i(x^{\mu})$

• Generically, such a metric , g(0), is <u>**not</u>** a solution to Einstein-AdS equations.</u>

Nevertheless , for slowly varying functions $b(x^{\mu})$, $\beta_i(x^{\mu})$

it is a good approximation to a true solution provided the functions $b(x^{\mu}) \, \beta_i(x^{\mu})$

obey a set of eqs which turn out to be the equations of boundary fluid dynamics.

Solve perturbatively Einstein-AdS's eqs order by order in a boundary derivative expansion:

 $g = g^{(0)}(\beta_i, b) + \varepsilon g^{(1)}(\beta_i, b) + \varepsilon^2 g^{(2)}(\beta_i, b) + \mathcal{O}\left(\varepsilon^3\right)$ $\beta_i = \beta_i^{(0)} + \varepsilon \beta_i^{(1)} + \mathcal{O}\left(\varepsilon^2\right), \qquad b = b^{(0)} + \varepsilon b^{(1)} + \mathcal{O}\left(\varepsilon^2\right) \begin{pmatrix} L_{mfp} \sim 1/T \\ \downarrow \\ \downarrow \\ L_{\Delta T}, \Delta \beta_i \end{pmatrix} = L_{mfp}$



Given the solution at order *n*, use AdS/CFT dictionary to construct the **boundary stress tensor**: compute extrinsic curvature tensor of surface at fixed r, and use def.:

$$T^{\mu}_{\nu} \sim -2 \lim_{r \to \infty} r^4 \left(K^{\mu}_{\nu} - \delta^{\mu}_{\nu} \right)$$

Perturbative solutions to the gravitational eqs **exist only** when the velocity and temperature fields **obey** certain equations of motion: $V_{\mu}I^{\mu\nu}_{(n)} = 0$ $T^{\mu\nu} = (\pi T)^4 \left(\eta^{\mu\nu} + u^{\mu} u^{\nu} \right) - 2(\pi T)^3 \sigma^{\mu\nu} + \mathcal{O}(\partial^2 u) + \cdots$ Policastro, Perfect fluid: $T^{\mu
u}_{(0)}$ $T^{\mu
u}_{(1)}$ Shear viscosity: $\eta=\pi^3T^3$ Son, **Starinets**

Einstein-AdS gravity is dual to Fluid dynamics

Scherk-Schwarz (SS) AdS/ SS QFT (Witten 1998) (Nice review: Mateos 2007) AdS/CFT (IIB ST on $AdS_5 \times S^5$ / 4d N=4 SYM) \neq QCD (• Non-Conformal • Non-SUSY • Has Confinement → Would like to have: String Theory / QCD duality → To approach QCD: Non-AdS / Non-Conformal gauge theory duality Start with N D4-branes. Gauge theory on it: 5d max SUSY SU(N) SYM theory (gluons + scalars + fermions)

To get 4d theory, compactify along y-direction w/ antiperiodic BC (SS) for fermions:

- **7** Key Features of QCD
- breaks SUSY
 Non-Conformal
 Confined & Deconfined phases **Confinement/Deconfinement phase transition**
- Gravity solution dual to gauge theory on D4-branes

Start with near-extremal D4-branes

and take appropriate decoupling (low-energy) limit.

• Black hole (from decoupling limit of D4-branes):
$$f(r) = 1 - \frac{r_0^3}{r^3}$$

 $ds_{\rm BH}^2 = \left(\frac{r}{R}\right)^{3/2} \left(-f dt^2 + dx_{(3)}^2 + dy^2\right) + \left(\frac{R}{r}\right)^{3/2} \frac{dr^2}{f} + \cdots$

- $\{t, x_{(3)}, y\}\,$ span worldvolume of the D4-branes $\,\equiv\,$ gauge theory coords: $\,y \sim y + L\,$
- Hawking temperature 7 (identify w/ gauge theory 7): $t
 ightarrow it_{
 m E}$

$$\begin{split} ds_{\rm E}^2 &= \left(\frac{r}{R}\right)^{3/2} \left(f dt_{\rm E}^2 + dx_{(3)}^2 + dy^2\right) + \left(\frac{R}{r}\right)^{3/2} \frac{dr^2}{f} & r \neq r \neq r_0 \\ \text{Regularity at } r &= r_0 \text{,} \\ \text{compactify } t_{\rm E} \text{ on } S_{\beta}^1 \text{ w/ length } \beta = 1/T & r_0 \neq r_0 \end{split}$$

ullet Trivial observation: Relabelling $t_{
m E} \leftrightarrow y$ we still have solution (Euclidean) gravity,

• Consequences ?

<u>Two</u> candidates for the geometry dual to gauge theory on D-branes.

Compute Free Energy to find which one dominates the partition function.



- At (& in vicinity of) $T_c = 1/L$ the two phases can co-exist separated by domain wall





• For large plasma lumps (neglect thickness of wall), & neglecting Dissipation, Diffusion:

$$T^{\mu\nu} = T^{\mu\nu}_{\text{perf}} + T^{\mu\nu}_{\text{bdry}},$$

$$T^{\mu\nu}_{\text{perf}} = \left[(\rho + P) \, u^{\mu} u^{\nu} + P g^{\mu\nu} \right] \Theta(-f), \qquad T^{\mu\nu}_{\text{bdry}} = -\sigma h^{\mu\nu} |\partial f| \, \delta(f)$$

→ II. Gravity / Hydrodynamics duality So what ?

Henceforth,

we do hydrodynamics with a fluid whose equation of state describes the *d*-dim (non-conformal) SS plasma that the gauge theory is "made of"

.... to get information on Black holes !

SS reduced AdS (d+2) gravity \iff (d +1)-dim SS gauge theory

d-dim Hydrodynamics with (non-conformal) plasma

Hydrodynamic description of deconfined plasma lumps
 Navier-Stokes, Continuity and Young-Laplace eqs

• For large plasma lumps (neglect thickness of wall), & neglecting Dissipation, Diffusion:

$$\begin{split} T^{\mu\nu} &= T^{\mu\nu}_{\text{perf}} + T^{\mu\nu}_{\text{bdry}} \,, \\ T^{\mu\nu}_{\text{perf}} &= \left[\left(\rho + P \right) u^{\mu} u^{\nu} + P g^{\mu\nu} \right] \Theta(-f) \,, \qquad T^{\mu\nu}_{\text{bdry}} = -\sigma h^{\mu\nu} |\partial f| \, \delta(f) \end{split}$$

• Eqs describing dynamics of the fluid follow from the conservation of stress tensor :

$$\nabla_{\mu}T^{\mu\nu} = 0$$

$$\begin{array}{ll} \mbox{Volume} \\ \mbox{contribution} \end{array} \left[\begin{array}{ll} \mbox{Continuity eq.:} & u^{\mu} \nabla_{\mu} \rho + (\rho + P) \nabla_{\mu} u^{\mu} = 0 \\ \\ \mbox{Navier-Stokes eq.:} & (\rho + P) u^{\mu} \nabla_{\mu} u^{\nu} = - \left(g^{\mu\nu} + u^{\mu} u^{\nu} \right) \nabla_{\mu} P \\ \\ \mbox{Boundary} \\ \mbox{contribution} \end{array} \right] \left[\begin{array}{ll} \mbox{Young-Laplace eq.:} & & \mbox{Boundary} \\ P_{<} - P_{>} = \sigma K \,, & K \equiv h_{\mu}^{\ \nu} \nabla_{\nu} n^{\mu} & & u^{\mu} n_{\mu} = 0 \end{array} \right]$$

Hydrodynamic description of deconfined plasma lumps Stationary Plasma Configurations $T^{\mu\nu}_{\rm disc} = -\zeta \vartheta P^{\mu\nu} - 2\eta \sigma^{\mu\nu} + q^{\mu} u^{\nu} + u^{\mu} q^{\nu}$ Bulk visc. Shear visc. Heat diffusion • Stationarity \implies NO Dissipation \implies . $\begin{array}{c} \vartheta = 0 \\ \sigma_{\mu\nu} = 0 \end{array}$ Local fluid temperature Local entropy • Plug in vorticity def.: $\nabla^{\mu}u^{\nu} = \omega^{\mu\nu} - u^{\mu}a^{\nu}$ density 🔪 • Euler relation: $\rho + P = Ts$ $\xrightarrow{\text{Differentiate}}$ Gibbs-Duhem: dP = sdTEuler Corrections @ • Mechanical equilibrium $\implies u^{\mu} \nabla_{\mu} P = 0$ Cardoso, Dall'Agata, Grasso $\Rightarrow a_{\mu} = -(\rho + P)^{-1} \nabla_{\mu} P = -\nabla_{\mu} \ln \mathcal{T}$ **Navier-Stokes** $\implies \text{Heat flux vanishes: } q^{\mu} = -\kappa (g^{\mu\nu} + u^{\mu}u^{\nu})(\nabla_{\nu}\mathcal{T} + a_{\nu}\mathcal{T}) = 0$ **Conc:** Stationary plasmas are both at hydrodynamical & thermal equilibrium

 $u^{\mu}\nabla_{\mu}\mathcal{T} = 0 \quad \Rightarrow u^{\mu}a_{\mu} = 0$

• Plug
$$a_{\mu} = -(\rho + P)^{-1} \nabla_{\mu} P = -\nabla_{\mu} \ln \mathcal{T}$$

in vorticity eq: $\nabla^{\mu} u^{\nu} = \omega^{\mu\nu} - u^{\mu} a^{\nu}$ $\longrightarrow \nabla_{(\mu} (\alpha u_{\nu)}) = \alpha u_{(\mu} \nabla_{\nu)} \ln(\alpha \mathcal{T})$

• If
$$\alpha \equiv \frac{T}{T} \Rightarrow \nabla_{(\mu} [\alpha u_{\nu)}] = 0$$

 αu^{μ} solves Killing eqs \Rightarrow Must be linear combination of background Killing vectors:

$$u = \frac{T}{V} \left(\xi - \Omega_I \chi_I \right) \qquad u^2 = -1 \Rightarrow \quad T = \frac{T}{\gamma}$$

stationary fluid must be
in rigid roto-translational
motion
$$T \text{ is the equilibrium plasma temperature}$$

Redshift factor relating LAB and comoving observers

Euler relation + Young-Laplace:
$$T = \frac{\sigma K + \rho}{\gamma s}$$

- Plasma *T* is dual to the Hawking temperature of the horizon. *T* is not proportional to the surface tension or to the mean curvature, but grows with both.
- For a **static** fluid *K* is **constant** over the surface, <u>but</u> in a **stationary** fluid *K* **adjusts** to variations of fluid velocity near boundary.

Variational principles for equilibrium plasma configurations I. Maximization of the entropy at constant energy and momenta

Stationary background: $\,\xi=\partial_t\,$



• Given any Killing vector ψ^{μ} , define associated conserved charges (*E*, *J*):

$$\mathcal{Q}[\psi] = \int_{\Sigma_t} dv \ T_{\mu\nu} k^\mu \psi^\nu$$

• Conserved charge associated w/ $J^{\mu}_{S}=su^{\mu}$

$$S[\mathcal{P}] = -\int_{\mathcal{P}} (k \cdot u) s \, dv$$

Action: Maximization of the entropy at constant energy and momenta

$$\begin{split} I[\mathcal{P}] &= S[\mathcal{P}] - \beta E[\mathcal{P}] + \tilde{\omega}_I J_I[\mathcal{P}] \\ \text{Euler-Lagrange eqs with Lagrange multipliers, } \beta &= 1/T, \qquad \tilde{\omega}_I = \beta \Omega_I \\ \text{Young-Laplace eq.:} \ P_< - P_> &= \sigma K \end{split}$$

Derivation assumes:

• only stationarity of the background geometry and fluid; independent of fluid equation of state.

• does not assume any condition on the shape of bdry: it covers non-axisymmetric cases

2. Minimization of potential energy for fixed volume

Action: Minimization of potential energy for fixed volume

$$\widehat{I}[\mathcal{P}] = \underbrace{U_{\sigma}[\mathcal{P}] + U_{\mathrm{cf}}[\mathcal{P}]}_{\text{Surface tension + centrifugal contribution}} \\ \text{Euler-Lagrange with Lagrange multiplier, } \eta = P_{>} \\ \text{Young-Laplace eq.:} \quad P_{<} - P_{>} = \sigma K \\ \end{array}$$

Static case : fluids pick configurations that minimize area for fixed volume (well known result

• Actions for the two extremization problems are the same up to a negative constant :

- Use Definition conserved charges
 - Euler relation
 - Expression for Lagrange multipliers
 - $\implies \begin{array}{r} \text{Maximizing entropy} \\ \text{for fixed conserved charges} \end{array}$





 Fluid area minimization \(\leftarrow \)> BH area maximization, because in the duality: the BH horizon is not mapped to the fluid boundary, but to the entire fluid bulk.





Static plasmas in the phase diagram:



Static plasmas in the phase diagram:



Static equilibrium Plasmas Critical dimension in phase diagram



Static equilibrium Plasmas Critical dimension in phase diagram



• In the AdS context, *d*-dim fluids are related to D = d + 2-dim BHs :

relation between the two critical dimensions is truly startling



- Gravitational dual:
 - BHs, ultra-spinning BHs, (Non-) Uniform Black strings, Black Rings &
 - Predictions for new BH phases in SS AdS and even in asymptotically flat BHs



Unstable modes decrease the potential energy for fixed volume (or increase S for fixed E):

 $\Delta U_{\sigma} \leqslant 0 \text{ for fixed volume}$ $\implies kR_{o} \leqslant \sqrt{n}$

Marginal unstable mode signals
 Bifurcation point in phase diagram



<u>Rayleigh-Plateau instability on a plasma tube</u>

(Previous work on analogue model: Cardoso, OD, 2006)

• Boundary Perturbation:

$$r = R(t, z, \phi), \qquad R(t, z, \phi) = R_o + \epsilon e^{\omega t} e^{ikz + im\phi}, \qquad \epsilon \ll R_o$$

• Fluid Perturbations:

$$u^{\mu} = u^{\mu}_{(0)} + \delta u^{\mu}, \qquad P = P_{(0)} + \delta P, \qquad \rho = \rho_{(0)} + \delta \rho$$
$$\delta \rho = (n+3)\delta P$$

$$\delta Q(t, r, z, \phi) = \delta Q(r) e^{\omega t} e^{ikz + im\phi}, \qquad \delta Q \equiv \{\delta u^{\mu}, \delta P, \delta \rho\}$$

• Perturbed Continuity & Navier-Stokes

• BCs: Perturbed Young-Laplace & $\, u^\mu n_\mu = 0 \,$

Dispersion Relation :

$$\omega^{2} = \frac{n+3}{n+4} \frac{\sigma}{\rho_{*}R_{o}^{3}} \frac{pR_{o} I_{\frac{n+1}{2}}(pR_{o})}{I_{\frac{n-1}{2}}(pR_{o})} \left(n-k^{2}R_{o}^{2}-\omega^{2}R_{o}^{2}\right)$$
$$p = k \left(1+(n+3)\frac{\omega^{2}}{k^{2}}\right)^{\frac{1}{2}}$$





- Instability strength increases with the dimension.
- Threshold (marginal) wavenumber also:

 $kR_o\leqslant \sqrt{n}$



- Instability strength increases with the dimension.
- Threshold (marginal) wavenumber also:

$$kR_o \leqslant \sqrt{n}$$

Compare with <u>Gravitational</u> Gregory-Laflamme dispersion relation:



Again, NOTE:

- These are available results for **Vacuum** BHs
- Predictions for SS AdS BHs

• Threshold wavenumber :

$$k_c R_0 \sim \sqrt{D}$$
 (large D)

Kol, Sorkin, 2004

Rayleigh-Plateau instability on a plasma tube

 \leftrightarrow

Gregory-Laflamme instability on a black string • Addition of rotation increases the RP instability strength:



• <u>Gravitational dual</u>:

Addition of rotation increases the GL instability strength and threshold k

(Kleihaus, Kunz, Radu 2007) (Monteiro, Perry, Santos, 2009)

Plasma peanut instability of rotating plasma balls

V. Cardoso, OD, 0902.3560 V. Cardoso, OD, J. Rocha, (ongoing)

Rotating plasma balls are unstable against *m-lobed* perturbations for high rotation

signals a **bifurcation** to a new branch of **non-axisymmetric stationary** solutions:



This instability bounds dynamically the rotation of SS AdS BHs

Regime of validity of hydrodynamic description

• Thermodynamic quantities must vary slowly over the mean free path of the fluid, which is of the order of the deconfinement temperature:

$$L_{\Delta T} \gg L_{\mathrm{mfp}} \sim \frac{1}{T_c} \longrightarrow \lambda \gg T_c^{-1} \sim \frac{\sigma}{\rho_0}$$

Rayleigh-Plateau unstable frequencies and wavenumbers satisfy:

 $\{\omega R_o, kR_o\} \gg \frac{\sigma}{\rho_0 R_o}$ • Fluid surface, has a finite thickness of the order $1/T_c$. We want the curvature of the surface to be small with respect to $1/T_c$:

$$R_{\rm bdry} \gg \Delta R_{\rm bdry} \sim \frac{1}{T_c} \longrightarrow \{R_{\rm o} > R_{\rm i}, R_{\rm o} - R_{\rm i}\} \gg \frac{\sigma}{\rho_0}$$

• We have **neglected** the dependence of the **surface tension** on the **temperature**.

Demand that on the boundary the temperature of the plasma remains close to $\,T_{c}$

• In short :
$$\frac{\sigma}{\rho_0 R} \ll 1 \longrightarrow \text{Large plasma balls}$$

Fluid dynamics : a guide for unknown dynamics of vacuum BHs

- Cannot take $R_{AdS}
 ightarrow \infty$ because fluid description of AdS BHs requires $rac{r_h}{R_{ads}} \gg 1$
- We have to find "large" vacuum BHs.... But what is large in vacuum?
- Vacuum GR is scale invariant: all properties of a black hole scale uniformly with mass (all Schw. BHs are equal; all Kerr BHs with same J/GM^2 are equal,...)
- In the **fluid**, **NO** scale invariance: σ sets a scale that distinguishes lumps of different size. (a fluid ball with radius 2R can break up more easily than a ball with radius R).
 - Fluid: relative entropy cost of breaking into two pieces becomes arbitrarily small as the radius R of the ball gets arbitrarily large ($\Delta S < 0$, supressed):

$$\frac{\Delta S}{S}\Big|_{\text{fluid}} = \frac{2S_1 - S_0}{S_0}\Big|_{\text{fluid}} \propto \frac{-\sigma}{\rho_0 R}$$

• Black hole, in contrast, it remains constant independently of the black hole size:

$$\frac{\Delta S}{S}\Big|_{\rm bh} = \frac{2S_1 - S_0}{S_0}\Big|_{\rm bh} = 2^{-\frac{1}{D-3}} - 1$$

Fluid dynamics : a guide for unknown dynamics of vacuum BHs ?

.... So, what is large BH in vacuum?

- Important **difference** between fluids and BHs: two disconnected lumps of fluid do **not** attract each other
- Limit in which vacuum black holes behave as fluids must be a limit in which gravitational attraction is suppressed

• Gravitational attraction gets suppressed as number of dimensions *D* grows (Grav. potential becomes steeper & + localized near source, and flatter & weaker at large distances)

- Our proposal:
 - a BH is large or small depending on the number of spacetime dimensions it lives in.
 - a large BH (ie living in high D) should have a fluid description
 - identify the "new vacuum GR scale" with the fluid scale: $\frac{\sigma}{\rho_0 R} = \frac{1}{D}$
- In large *D* limit:
 - No entropy cost in splitting a BH: $\Delta S/S
 ightarrow 0$ (as for fluids)
 - Gregory-Laflamme wave equation and threshold mode reduce to the fluid form: $\chi''(r) + \frac{D}{r}\chi'(r) k^2\chi(r) = 0 \qquad \qquad k_c R_0 \sim \sqrt{D}$

Rayleigh-Plateau Time evolution on a plasma tube



(Tjahjadi, Stone, Ottino, 1992)

Rayleigh-Plateau Time Evolution



Gregory-Laflamme Time evolution





Time

Choptuik, Lehner, Olabarrieta, Petryk, Pretorius, Villegas, gr-qc/0304085

Rayleigh-Plateau Time Evolution



Gregory-Laflamme Time evolution





Choptuik, Lehner, Olabarrieta, Petryk, Pretorius, Villegas, gr-qc/0304085



Kubitschek & Weidman (2007)





Kubitschek & Weidman (2007)

Thank You!



Kubitschek & Weidman (2007)





Kubitschek & Weidman (2007)